

# MAR 2 9 2019

The Honorable Patty Murray Ranking Member Committee on Health, Education, Labor & Pensions United States Senate Washington, DC 20515

## Dear Ranking Member Murray:

As requested in both the joint explanatory statement accompanying the *Consolidated Appropriations Act of 2018*, and Senate Report 115-150, we are transmitting to Congress the enclosed information regarding borrower defense applications made pursuant to Section 455(h) of the *Higher Education Act of 1965*, as amended, 20 U.S.C. § 1087e(h), and our implementing regulations.

The enclosed report provides information regarding the total borrower defense applications received and discharged as of December 31, 2018, both nationally and by state. The report also provides the median outstanding debt for borrower defense applicants prior to discharge, as well as the median loan debt remaining for applicants who received a partial discharge. The report also calculates the percentage of the approved applications that received a partial discharge, or less than 100% relief. This quarter, as requested, we also calculated the percentage of the total approved applications that received 100% relief.

The total amount discharged and the number of approved and denied claims included in the enclosed report has not changed from what we previously reported, as a result of ongoing litigation and the prioritization of the implementation of the borrower defense to repayment final regulations (the "2016 final regulations") that we promulgated on November 1, 2016, at 81 Fed. Reg. 75,926. You may notice that the count of applications in various categories has decreased from previous reports. These decreases are attributable only to our transition to a new borrower defense application processing platform that allows for more enhanced functionality, which among other things, allowed us to systematically identify duplicate applications. From this report, we have excluded duplicate applications and will continue to do so going forward.

With the next release of this report, the Department plans to augment the existing report with additional information that will make it easier to quickly determine new activity that occurred during the quarter. Specifically, whenever privacy restrictions do not apply, the report will display the total number of claims by category at the state level as well as the associated change in the number of claims since the last report.



As of this quarterly report, we remain subject to the preliminary injunction issued<sup>6</sup> in the case of *Manriquez v. DeVos*, No. 17-cv-7210 (N.D. Cal.). The injunction enjoins us from using a methodology we had developed to quantify the amount of relief that borrowers would receive for certain types of approved borrower defense applications. Furthermore, we are devoting significant resources to implementing the 2016 final regulations and supporting oversight and transparency efforts. As noted in last quarter's report, we had delayed the effective date of the 2016 final regulations to July 1, 2019, and as a result had not implemented those regulations. However, these delays were vacated in the fall of 2018 in the case *Bauer v. DeVos*, No. 17-cv-1330 (D.D.C.). As a result of the court's orders in *Bauer*, we have been diligently implementing the 2016 final regulations. Even with our limited resources being devoted to implementation, oversight, and transparency work, we plan to increase our adjudication of borrower defense applications in the future.

In the coming weeks, we plan to post the enclosed report in its entirety on the Federal Student Aid Data Center at <u>StudentAid.gov/data-center</u>. While previous published reports included the high-level data only, the Department will now provide state-level information on its website.

If you have any questions about this report, please have your staff contact Molly Petersen in the Office of Legislation and Congressional Affairs by email at Molly.Petersen@ed.gov or by phone at (202) 401-0020.

Sincerely,

Mark A. Brown

**Chief Operating Officer** 

Enclosure

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> The Department has filed an appeal of the preliminary injunction order with the Ninth Circuit Court of Appeals, and that appeal is pending.

## Borrower Defense - Quarterly Report - for quarter end 12/31/2018\*

Total Received Claims	218,366	Percentage of the total approved claims receiving partial discharge	31.3%
Total Pending Claims	158,110	Percentage of the total approved claims receiving 100% discharge	68.7%
Total Approved Claims	47,942	Total dollar amount of outstanding debt prior to discharge	\$602,445,930
Total Denied Claims	9,077	Median dollar amount of outstanding debt prior to discharge	\$ 11,542
Total Closed Claims	3,237	Median loan debt remaining for claims receiving partial discharge	\$ 7,851
Total Amount Discharged	\$534,765,563		

### State Level Breakouts:

Total Received		
Borrower State of Residence	Total Received	
TOTAL	218,366	
CA	49,804	
FL	18,201	
TX	16,768	
IL	11,242	
GA	9,559	
WA	7,878	
MA	6,366	
ОН	6,611	
NY	6,219	
PA	6,001	
MI	5,867	
NC	5,577	
VA	5,138	
IN	4,205	
MO	4,068	
CO	3,647	
AZ	3,717	
MN	3,502	
NJ	3,517	
OR	3,281	
MD	3,178	
TN	2,949	
NV	2,881	
HI	2,533	
WI	2,529	
sc	2,305	
AL	2,047	
KY	1,891	
LA	1,733	

Total Pending		Total Ap	prove
Borrower State of Residence	Pending	Borrower State of Residence	Appro
TOTAL	158,110	TOTAL	4
CA	31,971	CA	1:
FL	13,864	MA	;
TX	12,158	TX	
IL	8,335	FL	:
GA	7,018	WA	1
ОН	5,558	GA	
NY	5,290	IL	
WA	4,991	МІ	
PA	4,665	VA	
NC	4,400	NC	
MI	4,031	PA	
VA	3,789	HI	
IN	3,487	ОН	
AZ	3,332	OR	
МО	3,137	CO	
NJ	2,859	МО	
MN	2,774	NY	
co	2,684	MN	
MD	2,537	IN	
TN	2,527	NJ	
MA	2,309	NV	
NV	2,253	SC	
OR	2,196	MD	
WI	2,147	TN	
SC	1,837	MS	
AL	1,674	AL	
KY	1,669	AZ	
LA	1,403	LA	
HI	1,346	AR	

Total Ap	proved	Total De
Sorrower State of esidence	Approved	Borrower State of Residence
TAL	47,942	TOTAL
	15,047	CA
	3,857	IL
	3,464	TX
	3,230	FL
١	2,289	GA
	1,875	WA
	1,727	MI
	1,463	PA
	1,039	VA
	976	MD
	972	OR
	913	СО
	841	NV
	836	NY
	774	IN
	729	HI
	699	МО
	643	ОН
	522	NC
	515	WI
	433	NJ
	382	MA
	369	AZ
	359	SC
	342	UT
	307	wv
	307	TN
	273	LA
	235	DC

Total Denied		Tota	Total Closed		
rower ate of idence	Denied	Borrower State of Residence	Closed		
AL.	9,077	TOTAL	3,237		
	1,683	CA	1,103		
	1,039	TX	184		
	962	FL	171		
	936	GA	138		
	528	ĪĽ	141		
	486	HI	119		
	318	MA	107		
	278	ОН	90		
	245	WA	112		
	241	MN	48		
	210	PA	86		
	163	NC	86		
	162	VA	65		
	160	NY	70		
	159	МІ	55		
	155	МО	64		
	138	MS	52		
	122	OR	39		
	115	WI	46		
	105	IN	37		
	103	MD	31		
	93	NJ	40		
	58	NV	33		
	57	AL	33		
	48	Less than 30	287		

Total Amount Discharged			
Borrower State of Residence	1	Total Discharged	
TOTAL	\$	534,765,562.65	
CA	\$	181,534,401.68	
FL	\$	42,988,608.01	
MA	\$	30,668,620.67	
TX	\$	25,655,187.48	
GA	\$	21,052,060.65	
WA	\$	18,933,759.95	
IL.	\$	14,977,976.71	
NC	\$	14,869,392.57	
MI	\$	14,153,986.21	
HI	\$	12,586,220.53	
PA	\$	12,221,509.98	
OR	\$	10,492,103.89	
ОН	\$	10,464,714.95	
VA	\$	10,213,706.62	
NY	\$	9,693,154.96	
CO	\$	8,620,865.33	
MO	\$	7,151,531.27	
NV	\$	6,375,114.85	
SC	\$	6,033,202.05	
N	\$	5,863,531.95	
TN	\$	5,714,017.12	
MD	\$	5,222,338.59	
VIS	\$	4,884,963.73	
MN	\$	4,859,558.93	
٧J	\$	4,527,620.08	
AL .	\$	4,442,080.99	
_A	\$	4,015,068.21	
AZ	\$	3,850,660.42	
<Υ	\$	3,021,453.11	

AK 238 ND 225 FC 190 VT 124 PR 73 VI 64 AE 51		
OK       1,211         KS       1,126         WV       1,044         AR       1,086         IA       872         CT       927         NM       754         ID       713         NE       599         DC       505         NH       404         DE       372         MT       343         WY       314         ME       319         SD       271         RI       278         AK       238         ND       225         FC       190         VT       124         PR       73         VI       64         AE       51	MS	1,558
KS 1,126 WV 1,044 AR 1,086 IA 872 CT 927 NM 754 ID 713 NE 599 DC 505 NH 404 DE 372 MT 343 WY 314 ME 319 SD 271 RI 278 AK 238 ND 225 FC 190 VT 124 PR 73 VI 64 AE 51	UT	1,381
WV 1,044 AR 1,086 IA 872 CT 927 NM 754 ID 713 NE 599 DC 505 NH 404 DE 372 MT 343 WY 314 ME 319 SD 271 RI 278 AK 238 ND 225 FC 190 VT 124 PR 73 VI 64 AE 51	ок	1,211
AR 1,086 IA 872 CT 927 NM 754 ID 713 NE 599 DC 505 NH 404 DE 372 MT 343 WY 314 ME 319 SD 271 RI 278 AK 238 ND 225 FC 190 VT 124 PR 73 VI 64 AE 51	KS	1,126
IA 872 CT 927 NM 754 ID 713 NE 599 DC 505 NH 404 DE 372 MT 343 WY 314 ME 319 SD 271 RI 278 AK 238 ND 225 FC 190 VT 124 PR 73 VI 64 AE 51	wv	1,044
CT 927 NM 754 ID 713 NE 599 DC 505 NH 404 DE 372 MT 343 WY 314 ME 319 SD 271 RI 278 AK 238 ND 225 FC 190 VT 124 PR 73 VI 64 AE 51	AR	1,086
NM 754 ID 713 NE 599 DC 505 NH 404 DE 372 MT 343 WY 314 ME 319 SD 271 RI 278 AK 238 ND 225 FC 190 VT 124 PR 73 VI 64 AE 51	IA	872
ID 713 NE 599 DC 505 NH 404 DE 372 MT 343 WY 314 ME 319 SD 271 RI 278 AK 238 ND 225 FC 190 VT 124 PR 73 VI 64 AE 51	CT	927
NE 599 DC 505 NH 404 DE 372 MT 343 WY 314 ME 319 SD 271 RI 278 AK 238 ND 225 FC 190 VT 124 PR 73 VI 64 AE 51	NM	754
DC 505 NH 404 DE 372 MT 343 WY 314 ME 319 SD 271 RI 278 AK 238 ND 225 FC 190 VT 124 PR 73 VI 64 AE 51	ID	713
NH     404       DE     372       MT     343       WY     314       ME     319       SD     271       RI     278       AK     238       ND     225       FC     190       VT     124       PR     73       VI     64       AE     51	NE	599
DE 372 MT 343 WY 314 ME 319 SD 271 RI 278 AK 238 ND 225 FC 190 VT 124 PR 73 VI 64 AE 51	DC	505
MT 343 WY 314 ME 319 SD 271 RI 278 AK 238 ND 225 FC 190 VT 124 PR 73 VI 64 AE 51	NH	404
WY 314 ME 319 SD 271 RI 278 AK 238 ND 225 FC 190 VT 124 PR 73 VI 64 AE 51	DE	372
ME 319 SD 271 RI 278 AK 238 ND 225 FC 190 VT 124 PR 73 VI 64 AE 51	MT	343
SD     271       RI     278       AK     238       ND     225       FC     190       VT     124       PR     73       VI     64       AE     51	WY	314
RI 278 AK 238 ND 225 FC 190 VT 124 PR 73 VI 64 AE 51	ME	319
AK 238 ND 225 FC 190 VT 124 PR 73 VI 64 AE 51	SD	271
ND 225 FC 190 VT 124 PR 73 VI 64 AE 51	RI	278
FC 190 VT 124 PR 73 VI 64 AE 51	AK	238
VT 124 PR 73 VI 64 AE 51	ND	225
PR 73 VI 64 AE 51	FC	190
VI 64 AE 51	VT	124
AE 51	PR	73
	VI	64
Less than 30 110	AE	51
	Less than 30	110

UT	1,144
MS	1,126
ОК	1,041
KS	964
AR	815
CT	774
wv	743
IA	698
NM	658
ID III	590
NE	481
DC	373
NH	295
DE	286
MT	265
ME	245
RI	227
SD	211
WY	194
ND	177
AK	169
FC	97
VT	81
PR	63
AE	37
VI	39
Less than 30	76

WI	231
wv	230
UT	182
KY	177
IA	147
KS	138
ок	137
CT	130
ID	109
WY	109
NE	101
NH	97
NM	87
DC	81
FC	71
DE	70
МТ	64
ME	62
AK	56
SD	49
RI	46
ND	43
VT	36
Less than 30	71

MS	38
MN	37
AL	33
Less than 30	227

WI	\$ 2,842,268.55
AR	\$ 2,693,604.27
WV ·	\$ 2,475,106.47
KS	\$ 2,074,560.94
UT	\$ 1,821,799.26
IA	\$ 1,681,706.17
ОК	\$ 1,618,205.02
CT	\$ 1,467,437.04
ID	\$ 1,242,733.49
NE	\$ 1,050,694.52
NM	\$ 1,023,915.71
WY	\$ 1,023,544.83
DE	\$ 997,436.54
NH	\$ 975,557.41
FC	\$ 918,270.21
MT	\$ 889,873.78
DC	\$ 797,027.97
AK	\$ 688,927.93
ME	\$ 685,577.58
રા	\$ 612,236.75
SD	\$ 559,249.52
ND	\$ 432,409.52
/I	\$ 357,365.20
/T	\$ 300,486.42
<b>λ</b> Ε	\$ 134,933.88
3U	\$ 133,610.94
ess than \$100,000	\$ 179,611.24

### NOTES\*

Enhanced functionality, now available in borrower defense system, Customer Engagement Management System (CEMS), allows the U.S. Department of Education (ED) to more quickly identify potential duplicate claims. As a result, the methodology of this report now excludes duplicate applications. Due to this change, it is possible that the counts of claims in various categories may decrease from previous quarters' reports.

Outstanding and remaining debt amounts exclude consolidation loans and loans previously paid off by consolidation.

As referenced in the letter submitted from ED regarding the 6/30/2018 Borrower Defense Quarterly Congressional report, data provided at the state level presents an inadvertent disclosure risk. Therefore, the aggregate data is provided on a quarterly basis, but the state data biannually due to small numbers of applications.

All dollar amounts and percent elements in the 12/31/2018 Quarterly report that are unchanged from the 9/30/2018 Quarterly report reflect the fact that ED deferred processing of discharges during this quarter as a result of ongoing litigation. This includes the values referenced: Total Amount Discharged, Percentage of the total approved claims receiving partial discharge, Total dollar amount of outstanding debt prior to discharge and Median loan debt remaining for claims receiving partial discharge.

#### Data Descriptions:

Total Received Claims: Total count of applications received by ED that have passed initial intake reviews and deemed ready for further review and adjudication.

Total Denied Claims: Total count of applications that ED reviewed and signed off as denied applications.

Total Closed Claims: Total count of applications closed with no need for adjudication. (e.g. borrower requests that ED stop processing application.)

Total Pending Claims: Total count of applications under review prior to a determination.

Total Approved Claims: Total count of applications approved for discharge.

Total Amount of Discharges: Total dollar amount associated with discharged applications.

#### Sources:

CEMS Borrower Defense System

NSLDS (National Student Loan Data System)